Report of the National Bridging Workshop on the International Health Regulations (IHR) and the OIE Performance of Veterinary Services (PVS) Pathway

9-11 May 2017
Islamabad, Pakistan

Organized by WHO and OIE in collaboration with the Ministry of National Food Security & Research and the Ministry of National Health Services, Regulations & Coordination
Acknowledgments

The organizers of the meeting would like to express their gratitude to the authorities of Pakistan for their support in the preparation and conduction of the event and more particularly to

- Dr Malik Muhammad Safi, Director Programs, Ministry of National Health Services, Regulation & Coordination

- Dr Qurban Ali, Animal Husbandry Commissioner, Chief Veterinary Officer, Ministry of National Food Security and Research

- The WHO country office, with a special thanks to Dr Mohammad Assai Ardakani, WHO representative a.i. in Pakistan and Dr Farah Sabih whose commitment and support at all stages of the preparation has been an invaluable support.

This workshop was funded by the European Commission's Directorate-General for International Cooperation and Development, as one of the component of the project “IFS/2014/350-752 One Health Project in Pakistan”
### TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TABLE OF CONTENTS</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABBREVIATIONS &amp; ACRONYMS</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Background</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objectives of the workshop and expected outcomes</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preparatory Work</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REPORT ON THE SESSIONS</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opening session</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Session 1: The One Health Concept and National Perspectives</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Session 2: Interactions on The Road to One Health</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Session 3: Navigating the Road to One Health – Collaboration Gaps</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Session 4: Bridges along the Road to One Health</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Session 5: Crossroads – PVS Pathway and IHR MEF reports</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Session 6: Road Planning</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Session 7: Roadmap – Reaching consensus</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Closing Session</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WORKSHOP OUTPUTS</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Output 1: Objectives and actions identified per technical areas</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Output 2: Prioritization results</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Output 3: Link with the IHR National Action Plan for Pakistan</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Output 4: Immediate follow-ups by province / region</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Output 5: TORs of the One Health Hub</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Output 6: Coordination mechanisms</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Output 7: Key workshop recommendations &amp; way forward</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WORKSHOP EVALUATION</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annex 1: Workshop agenda</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annex 2: List of participants</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviation</td>
<td>Definition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AI</td>
<td>Avian Influenza</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AJK</td>
<td>Azad Jammu and Kashmir</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCHF</td>
<td>Crimean-Congo Hemorrhagic Fever</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FATA</td>
<td>Federally Administered Tribal Areas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAO</td>
<td>Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FELTP</td>
<td>Field Epidemiology and Laboratory Training Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FP</td>
<td>Focal Point</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HQ</td>
<td>Headquarters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IHR</td>
<td>International Health Regulations (2005)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDSR</td>
<td>Integrated Disease Surveillance &amp; Response</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IT</td>
<td>Information technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JEE</td>
<td>Joint External Evaluation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KPK</td>
<td>Khyber Pakhtunkhwa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIMS</td>
<td>Laboratory Information Management System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MEF</td>
<td>Monitoring and Evaluation Framework</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MNFSR</td>
<td>Ministry of National Food Security and Research</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MNHSRC</td>
<td>Ministry of National Health Services Regulations and Coordination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NAP</td>
<td>National Action Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NIH</td>
<td>National Institute of Health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OIE</td>
<td>World Organisation for Animal Health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PH</td>
<td>Public Health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PMDC</td>
<td>Pakistan Medical and Dental Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PVMC</td>
<td>Pakistan Veterinary Medical Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PVS</td>
<td>Performance of Veterinary Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOP</td>
<td>Standard Operating Procedures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOR</td>
<td>Terms of Reference</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHO</td>
<td>World Health Organization</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
INTRODUCTION

BACKGROUND

The World Health Organization (WHO) and the World Organisation for Animal Health (OIE) are the two main international organizations responsible for proposing references and guidance for the public health and animal health sectors respectively. WHO and OIE have been active promoters and implementers of an intersectoral collaborative approach among institutions and systems to prevent, detect, and control diseases among animals and humans. They have developed various frameworks, tools and guidance material to strengthen capacities at the national, regional and global levels.

- WHO Member States adopted a legally binding instrument, the International Health Regulations (IHR, 2005), for the prevention and control of events that may constitute a public health emergency of international concern. Through these regulations, States Parties are required to develop, strengthen and maintain minimum national core public health capacities to detect, assess, notify and respond to public health threats and as such, should implement plans of action to develop and ensure that the core capacities required by the IHR are present and functioning throughout their territories. Various assessment and monitoring tools have been developed by WHO such as the IHR Monitoring and Evaluation Framework (MEF), which includes *inter alia* the Annual Reporting Questionnaire for Monitoring Progress and the Joint External Evaluation (JEE) Tool.

- The OIE is the intergovernmental organization responsible for developing standards, guidelines and recommendations for animal health and zoonoses; these are mainly laid down in the OIE Terrestrial and Aquatic Animal Codes and Manuals. In order to achieve the sustainable improvement of national Veterinary Services’ compliance with those standards, in particular on the quality of Veterinary Services, the OIE has developed the Performance of Veterinary Services (PVS) Pathway, which is composed of different tools to assist countries to objectively assess and address the main weaknesses of their Veterinary Services.
These support tools shift away from externally driven, short-term, emergency response type ‘vertical’ approaches addressing only specific diseases, and contribute to a more sustainable, long term ‘horizontal’ strengthening of public and animal health systems. WHO IHR MEF and the OIE PVS Pathway approaches enable countries to determine strengths and weaknesses in their respective functions and activities, and promote prioritization and pathways for improvement. Furthermore, they propose to engage the countries in a routine monitoring and follow up mechanism on the overall level of performance and help to determine the needs for compliance with internationally adopted references or standards.

The use of WHO IHR monitoring tools and OIE PVS Pathway would result in a detailed assessment of the existing forces and gaps, with better alignment of capacity building approach and strategies at country level between the human and animal health sectors. The two organizations propose a format of workshops (the IHR PVS National bridging Workshops) enabling countries to further explore possible overlapping areas addressed in the OIE and IHR capacity frameworks and develop, where relevant, appropriate bridges to facilitate coordination. A structured approach using user-friendly material enables the identification of synergies, review of gaps and the definition of operational strategies to be used by policy makers for concerted corrective measures and strategic investments in national action plans for improved health security.

In Pakistan,
- a PVS Evaluation was conducted in November-December 2014 and
- a JEE mission was organized in April-May 2016.

**OBJECTIVES OF THE WORKSHOP AND EXPECTED OUTCOMES**

The main objectives of the National IHR-PVS bridging workshop are to provide an opportunity to human and animal health services to share their views on the current level of coordination between the two sectors, jointly review the gaps identified through respectively the PVS Pathway and the IHR MEF (including the JEE), and build on these results to jointly develop strategic actions to strengthen their preparedness for and control of zoonotic diseases.

The workshop aims were:

- to increase awareness and understanding of WHO’s IHR MEF and of OIE’s PVS Pathway;
- to discuss the outcomes of IHR and PVS Pathway country assessments and identify ways to use the outputs;
- to facilitate the intersectoral coordination through improved understanding of respective roles and mandates;
- to facilitate the identification of possible synergies through facilitated discussion on technical expertise, data, best practices, and resources;
- to provide comprehensive and realistic information from international organizations in order to identify tools to facilitate the institutionalization of coordination mechanisms and intersectoral cooperation including in terms of funding, aligning national priorities and strategies.

The agenda of the Workshop is available at Annex 1. It was attended by over 70 national participants (Annex 2), with approximately one half from the Ministry of National Health Services Regulations and Coordination and the other half...
from the Ministry of National Food Security & Research with representatives from the Federal and each Provincial / Regional level attending the three-day discussions. Representatives of the environmental sector, legal sector, media and health development partners were also present.

**PREPARATORY WORK**

The agenda of the workshop was developed in close collaboration between the WHO and the OIE based on the experience acquired during similar workshops held in Azerbaijan, Thailand and Costa Rica, with inputs from representatives of the MNHSRC and MNFSR. The agenda and technical inputs for the different sessions were finalized during on-site pre-workshop meetings.
REPORT ON THE SESSIONS

The workshop uses an interactive methodology and a structured approach with user-friendly material, case studies, videos and facilitation tools. Sessions were structured in a step-by-step process as follows:

OPENING SESSION

The opening ceremony was attended by high level national representatives, namely Dr Assad Hafeez - Director General and Dr Malik M Safi - Director Programs, MNHSRC; Dr Khurshid Ahmad – representing the Chief Veterinary Officer/ Animal Husbandry Commissioner, MNFSR and Dr Yusuf Zafar - Chairman Pakistan Agricultural Research Council. Also participating in the opening ceremony were Dr Mohammad Assai, WHO Representative in Pakistan, Dr Muhammad Afzal, representing FAO, Dr John Woodford – PVS experts, representing the OIE and Dr Stephane de La Rocque, head of the One Health Team in the department “Country Health Emergency Preparedness and IHR”, WHO HQ.

SESSION 1: THE ONE HEALTH CONCEPT AND NATIONAL PERSPECTIVES

A documentary video introduced the One Health Concept, its history, rationale and purpose and how it became an international paradigm. The video also introduced the workshop in the global and national context by providing high level background information on the collaboration between WHO, OIE and FAO.

Both MNHSRC and MNFSR then provided comprehensive presentations on their respective structure and experiences in responding to One Health related challenges. The workshop approach and methodology were explained and participants had the opportunity to introduce themselves.

SESSION 2: INTERACTIONS ON THE ROAD TO ONE HEALTH

Through a documentary video, the second session provided participants with concrete worldwide examples of intersectoral collaboration in addressing health issues at the human-animal interface. The session concluded with a plenary discussion on experience sharing regarding past intersectoral collaborations in preventing or managing zoonotic disease outbreaks.

SESSION 3: NAVIGATING THE ROAD TO ONE HEALTH – COLLABORATION GAPS

Participants were divided into 8 working groups of mixed participants from both sectors (MNHSRC and MNFSR) and from different levels (Federal, Provincial, Regional). Groups were provided with one of four case study scenarios based on diseases relevant to the Pakistan context; Avian influenza, Brucellosis, Crimea Congo Hemorrhagic Fever (CCHF) and rabies (Table 1), developed in collaboration with MNHSRC and MNFSR representatives.
Table 1: Scenarios used for the different case studies

Rabies – A stray dog which was known to have bitten two cows and was behaving aggressively towards members of the public and was reported to have bitten some children in the same neighborhood was shot dead by Police in the outskirts of Rawalpindi two days ago. The carcass of the dog was destroyed before the Veterinary authorities were able to take the head of the dog for confirmation of diagnosis.

CCHF – One week prior to the Eid-ul Azha celebrations six butchery workers from the District of Zhob (Balochistan) who had been involved in the routine slaughter of sheep died having developed acute haemorrhagic symptoms. Another person from the same butchery was admitted to hospital in Quetta and was diagnosed as having contracted CCHF.

Brucellosis – During the last month three cows all belonging to a small-holder dairy farmer in Kasur District (Punjab) aborted. At the time of the first two abortions the farmer did not bother to report the problem to his local veterinary officer as his farm was too far away from the District Veterinary Office. However, the third abortion took place a day before market day and he happened to be in town, where he met the District vet and he mentioned that 3 of his cows had recently aborted their calves. The veterinarian quickly went to the farm and carried out a Milk Ring Test on the three animals which had aborted and found them all to be positive for Brucellosis.

Avian Influenza – Two persons were admitted at the Faisalabad Allied Hospital with pneumonia. Laboratory testing by RT-PCR resulted positive for H7N9 subtype of avian influenza. One of the patients is a semi-commercial broiler producer who sells his birds three times a week at the local live bird market. The other patient reported having visited the same market 7 days prior to disease onset and having bought four quails.

Using experience from previous outbreaks of zoonotic diseases, the groups discussed on how they would have realistically managed these events, and evaluated the level of collaboration between the veterinary and the public health services for 16 key technical areas: coordination, investigation, surveillance, communication, etc. (Table 2). These activities/areas of collaboration were represented by color-coded technical area cards: green for “good collaboration”, yellow for “some collaboration”, and red for “collaboration needing improvement” (Figure 1).

Figure 1: Results obtained from one of the groups working on the Avian Influenza scenario. The level of the 16 key technical areas for collaboration has been assessed with 3 green, 10 yellow and 3 red cards.

During an ensuing plenary session, each group provided feedback on their work. Table 2 summarizes the results from the 8 working groups.
Table 2: Summary of results obtained from the Session 3 working group exercise:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Technical area (cards)</th>
<th>Rabies (1)</th>
<th>Rabies (2)</th>
<th>Brucellosis (1)</th>
<th>Brucellosis (2)</th>
<th>CCHF (1)</th>
<th>CCHF (2)</th>
<th>Influenza (1)</th>
<th>Influenza (2)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Coordination at high Level</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coordination at local Level</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coordination at technical Level</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legislation / Regulation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emergency funding</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communication w/ media</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communication w/stakeholders</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Field investigation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Response</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Risk assessment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joint surveillance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lab</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education and training</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human resources</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Logistics</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For each disease, the performance of the collaboration between the human health and the animal health sectors is color-coded: green for “good collaboration”, yellow for “some collaboration”, and red for “collaboration needing improvement”.

SESSION 4: BRIDGES ALONG THE ROAD TO ONE HEALTH

Documentary videos introduced the international legal frameworks followed by human health (IHR 2005) and animal health (OIE standards) as well as the tools available to assess the country’s capacities: the annual reporting and JEE tools for public health services and OIE PVS Pathway for veterinary services. The differences and connections between these tools were explained. A large matrix (IHR-PVS matrix), cross-connecting the indicators of the IHR MEF (in rows) and the indicators of the PVS Evaluation (in columns) was set-up and introduced to the participants (Figure 2).

Through an interactive approach, working groups were invited to plot their technical area cards onto the matrix by matching them to their corresponding indicators. A plenary analysis of the outcome showed clear gap clusters and illustrated that most gaps were not disease-specific but systemic.

Figure 2: Mapping of the technical area cards on the IHR-PVS matrix and plenary discussion

The main gaps (clusters) identified were associated with the following capacities:

- Coordination
- Field investigation and response
- Surveillance and laboratory
- Communication
- Human resources and training
SESSION 5: CROSSROADS – PVS PATHWAY AND IHR MEF REPORTS

New working groups with representation from all previous groups were organized for each of the five priority technical areas (Figure 3).

![Figure 3: Generic graph describing the organization of working groups for Session 3 (left) and Session 5-6 (right).](image)

The matrix was used to link the identified gaps to their relevant indicators in the IHR MEF and in the PVS Pathway. Each working group then opened the assessment reports (annual reporting, JEE, PVS Evaluation) and extracted the main findings and recommendations relevant to their technical area (Figure 4). To facilitate the process, the participants were suggested to use the WHO-OIE Handbook for the assessment of capacities at the human-animal interface\(^1\) in which the linkage between the indicators of the IHR MEF and the PVS Pathway are highlighted.

![Figure 4: Results obtained for the technical group focusing on Surveillance and Laboratory. The reporting panel is split into two columns (public health and animal health), orange and green post-its summarize respectively the gaps and the recommendations described in the assessment reports.](image)

\(^1\) http://www.who.int/ihr/publications/9789241511889/en/
SESSION 6: ROAD PLANNING

Using the same working groups as for the previous session, participants were asked to identify, for each technical area, three joint objectives to improve their collaboration. For each objective, they filled Action Cards, detailing the activities, their dates of expected implementation, the focal points responsible, the required support as well as measurable indicators (Figure 5).

![Figure 5: Identification of joint objectives and activities to improve collaboration between the sectors for surveillance.](image)

The feasibility and cost of each action were evaluated using blue and red stickers respectively and a semi-quantitative scale (1 to 3). The session ended with a World Café exercise: each group nominated a rapporteur whose duty was to summarize their outputs to the other groups. Each group rotated between the different boards to contribute and provide feedback on all technical areas. At the end of the cycle, each group returned to their original board and the rapporteur summarized the feedback and changes or additions suggested by the other participants (Figure 6).

![Figure 6: World café exercise: the group on Communication is providing feedback to the rapporteur of the group working on Investigation/Response.](image)

The following paragraphs summarize the results of the discussions of all working groups, which are fully detailed in Output 1.

**Technical area: Coordination**

The development of effective intersectoral coordination mechanisms was recognized as a critical need and a key objective. This could be reached in part by the identification of focal points at all levels, with defined terms of reference (TOR), the development of standard operating procedures (SOPs) for coordination between the sectors and the implementation of effective information sharing mechanisms. Regular intersectoral coordination meetings should be held at the different levels and joint simulation exercises conducted on a yearly basis.
Technical area: Human resources and training

Three main actions were identified to fill the gaps in terms of human resource and training:

- the establishment of a National Institute for Infectious and Zoonotic Diseases (after a feasibility study);
- the training and capacity building of animal and human health professionals, including para-medics and para-vets, through frequent on service and refresher trainings; and
- a need-based revision of the curricula at national level by the Pakistan Medical and Dental Council (PMDC) and the Pakistan Veterinary Medical Council (PVMC).

Technical area: Investigation and response

A key priority identified was the establishment of real-time intersectoral disease surveillance and response mechanisms, using One Health coordination units located at all levels with dedicated and trained staff from public health, animal health and environmental Ministries.

The development of multi-sectoral contingency plans for zoonotic diseases, clarifying the lines of command, the roles and the responsibilities in all sectors was also identified as a critical need.

The development of a joint IT system for the identification of outbreaks in both human or animal populations and the need to ensure availability and allocation of resources for investigation and response (following a needs assessment) were also discussed.

Technical area: Surveillance and laboratory

The main objectives identified to strengthen the intersectoral coordination for surveillance and laboratory related activities included the establishment of a One Health Hub at Federal, Provincial and District level; the establishment and strengthening of a joint laboratory network with a harmonized LIMS (Laboratory information management system); and the implementation of a cross-sectoral IDSR (Integrated Disease Surveillance & Reporting) mechanism, following a preliminary pilot study at District level.

Technical area: Communication

For communication actions, the highest priority was set for the development of a functional mechanism for joint communication, with dedicated units established at all levels, and identification of clear mechanisms for information sharing within and across sectors. The need for capacity building of communication staff through regular trainings and simulation exercises to enable mass communication in a harmonized and effective way was also recognized.

SESSION 7: ROADMAP – REACHING CONSENSUS

Prioritization

Participants were asked to connect via computers or smartphones to a web application (Figure 7) to prioritize the previously defined objectives by assessing their level of priority from ‘very low’ to ‘very high’. Fifty nine (59) participants voted (29 from ‘animal health’, 26 from ‘public health’, 1 from ‘environment’, 1 from ‘legal’, 1 from ‘communication’ and 1 from ‘other’) and the final results are detailed in Output 2.
Linkage with the IHR National Action Plan for Pakistan

A presentation followed by a plenary discussion showed how the prioritized actions could be linked to the IHR National Action Plan (IHR-NAP) and how outcomes of the workshop and particularly the identified actions could directly feed into it and contribute to reaching its objectives (Output 3).

After meeting actions

A final province wise group session was organized to discuss the next steps and the implementation of identified One Health action. Groups were asked the following questions:

- As a follow up of this meeting what will be the immediate action to improve the coordination for One Health?
- What should be the main points of a post workshop press release?

Results are documented in Output 4.

CLOSING SESSION

The closing session started by a presentation of the terms of reference for a One Health Hub (Output 5) as well as coordination mechanisms for surveillance and information sharing, coordinated response and overall risk mitigation (Output 6). Key workshop recommendations were also presented (Output 7).

The workshop ended with statements from MNHSRC and MNFSR indicating that both sectors took ownership of the outcomes of the workshop. They also ensured joint engagement in addressing the gaps identified for collaboration at the human-animal interface. Both the WHO and the OIE (represented by PVS expert John Woodford) reiterated their full commitment to support the country in improving this collaboration.

All the material used during the workshop, including movies, presentations, documents of references, results from the working groups and pictures were copied on a memory stick distributed to all participants. In addition, a short movie of the workshop is accessible at the following link:

https://drive.google.com/file/d/0B_FQSk1UulpbUNtWkFCajQybFk/view
## Output 1: Objectives and Actions Identified per Technical Areas

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Date of achievement</th>
<th>Feasibility (1-3 scale)</th>
<th>Cost (1-3 scale)</th>
<th>Responsibility</th>
<th>Required support</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Coordination</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1. Identification and notification of FPs and coordination taskforce with defined TORs at all levels in all sectors</td>
<td>December 2017</td>
<td>+++</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>MoH and all allied departments and ministries</td>
<td>Political, technical, retaining of notified and skilled person</td>
<td>-FPs notified -TORs defined -Taskforce notified</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2. Develop SOPs for coordination between the different sectors</td>
<td>June 2018</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>Lead by MoH, approved by taskforce</td>
<td>Technical, Financial</td>
<td>-SOPs approved by taskforce and implemented in relevant sectors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3. Conduct regular intersectoral coordination meetings</td>
<td>December 2017</td>
<td>+++</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>MoH and all allied departments and ministries</td>
<td>Financial</td>
<td>-Number of quarterly meetings -Number of emergency meetings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4. Conduct advocacy and awareness raising activities for the strengthening of intersectoral coordination</td>
<td>Continuous</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>IHR/One Health taskforce</td>
<td>Financial</td>
<td>-Meeting minutes -Session reports -Advocacy material developed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5. Develop effective intersectoral information sharing mechanisms</td>
<td>Continuous</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>+++</td>
<td>M&amp;E Cell</td>
<td>IT linkages</td>
<td>Joint reporting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6. Conduct regular multisectoral simulation exercises at all levels</td>
<td>Yearly</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>+++</td>
<td>MoH and all allied departments and ministries</td>
<td>Financial, Logistics, Mobility</td>
<td>-Simulation exercise reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7. Promulgate legislation at provincial and federal level for coordination</td>
<td>December 2018</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>FPs of relevant departments and taskforce</td>
<td>Technical from experts and law department</td>
<td>-Legislation passed by assembly -Regulations notified and implemented</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.8. Ensure sustainable allocation and availability of financial resources to implement the action plan</td>
<td>Continuous</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+++</td>
<td>All ministries and departments</td>
<td>Political commitment, technical</td>
<td>-Allocation of required funds -Availability of required funds -Timely release of funds</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.9. Monitoring and evaluation of coordination</td>
<td>Continuous</td>
<td>+++</td>
<td>+++</td>
<td>M&amp;E Cell</td>
<td>IT linkages</td>
<td>Joint reporting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Human resources and training</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1. Conduct a feasibility study</td>
<td>December 2018</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>+++</td>
<td>MNFSR</td>
<td>Financial, Technical, Political will</td>
<td>-Consultant hired -PC-1 approved -PC-1 executed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2. Develop PC-1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3. Approval and execution</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Objective 3: Capacity building of Animal and Human health professionals</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1. Training of trainers</td>
<td>June 2018</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>CEO of National Institute of Infectious and Zoonotic Diseases</td>
<td>Financial, HR, Experts of WHO, OIE and GOP</td>
<td>-Human resources trained</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2. On service / refresher trainings</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3. Trainings of para-meds / para-vets</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Objective 4: Need based revision and implementation of curricula at National level

| 4.1. Joint meeting of PMDC and PVMC for review of need based curricula | Continuous | ++ | + | HEC | Subject specialists / academicians | -Training needs assessed  
-Need-based curricula developed

| 4.2. Implementation under the umbrella of HEC | | | | | |

### Investigation and Response

### Objective 5: Establish real time integrated disease surveillance & response mechanisms based on One Health approach

| 5.1. Establish a one health coordination unit at all levels (federal, provincial, district) | December 2017 | ++ | ++ | -MNFSR and MNHSRC  
-Provincial Health and Livestock departments | Political commitment | -TORs developed  
-Identification of labs, offices and space

| 5.2. Placement of dedicated staff from public health, veterinary and environmental Ministries at all levels (rapid response units) | December 2017 | ++ | +++ | -Notified people from all levels  
-Contact list

| 5.3. Capacity building at all levels | | + | +++ |

### Objective 6: Development of multi-sectoral contingency plans for zoonotic diseases

| 6.1. Clarify line of command and control in both public health and veterinary health sectors | December 2017 | +++ | + | Physical spaces and staff | -Line of command clarified in case of emergencies

| 6.2. Identify alert thresholds for escalation | December 2017 | ++ | ++ | -Identified staff at all levels | Staff time | -System developed  
-Number of alerts generated  
-Reports produced

| 6.3. Development of IT system of identification of outbreaks for both sectors | June 2018 | ++ | + | -Provincial disease surveillance & response unit | IT support, Financial |

| 6.4. Clarify roles and responsibilities for emergencies | December 2017 | ++ | + | Human resources |

### Objective 7: Ensure availability and allocation of resources for investigation and response

| 7.1. Development of joint training based on competence | June 2018 | ++ | ++ | One Health Coordinator | Training coordination, Finances | -Training package developed  
-Training delivered

| 7.2. Need assessment and mapping of existing resources | December 2017 | ++ | + | Technical, Academia support | -Need assessment done at all levels

### Surveillance and Laboratory

### Objective 8: Establish and strengthen laboratory network

| 8.1. Develop harmonized LIMS and LINK with One Health Dashboard at Provincial and Federal Levels | June 2019 | ++ | +++ | Ministries / Departments | Technical, trainings, IT support, Financial  
-Functional LIMS  
-Number of trainings and participants  
-OH Dashboard functional  
-Recruited staff

| 8.2. Capacity building (Lab and field) | Continuous | +++ | ++ | Relevant Ministries/Departments | Technical, Financial, Recruitment, Trainings  
-Number of trainings  
-Number of participants  
-Recruited staff

| 8.3. Need assessment in both sectors | December 2017 | +++ | + | Ministries / Departments | Technical  
-List of gaps identified  
-SWOT conducted |
### Objective 9: Develop and implement a cross-sector IDSR (Infectious Disease Surveillance & Reporting) mechanism

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Feasibility</th>
<th>Cost</th>
<th>Participants</th>
<th>Implementations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Establishment of One Health Hub at Federal/Provincial/District Level Link</td>
<td>2020</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Ministries / Departments</td>
<td>Technical, Financial, IT - Functional OH Hub</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pilot testing of IDSR at District Level</td>
<td>December 2018</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>Ministries / Departments</td>
<td>Technical, Financial - Pilot test conducted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Develop joint list of notifiable diseases</td>
<td>December 2017</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>Ministries / Departments</td>
<td>Technical, Financial - Joint list of notifiable diseases notified</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Raise awareness of stakeholders and build capacity of field staff</td>
<td>Continuous</td>
<td>+++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>Ministries / Departments</td>
<td>Technical, Financial - Number of awareness sessions conducted</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Objective 10: Develop and implement legal framework for disease surveillance, prevention and control

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Feasibility</th>
<th>Cost</th>
<th>Participants</th>
<th>Implementations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Advocacy of policy makers and other stakeholders</td>
<td>December 2017</td>
<td>+++</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>Ministries / Departments</td>
<td>Technical, Financial, Political Commitment - Number of meetings/awareness sessions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Review draft 2010 PH Act and other laws/act, amend as needed and adopt</td>
<td>2021</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>Ministries / Departments</td>
<td>Technical, Financial - Reviewed Act - Approved Act</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Communication

#### Objective 11: Develop a functional mechanism for joint communication

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Feasibility</th>
<th>Cost</th>
<th>Participants</th>
<th>Implementations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Establish a communication unit at all levels</td>
<td>June 2017</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+++</td>
<td>National/Provincial concerned Departments</td>
<td>Financial, Infrastructure - TORs developed - Official notification of focal points</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Develop a mechanism for information sharing/communication</td>
<td>June 2017</td>
<td>+++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>Focal points for communication</td>
<td>Financial, Technical - Communication plan available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advocate for PVS/IHR communication across all sectors of One Health</td>
<td>2017-2021</td>
<td>+++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>National/Provincial taskforce + concerned department</td>
<td>Financial, Political commitment, IT support - Number of meetings/awareness sessions</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Objective 12: Capacity building of communication staff

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Feasibility</th>
<th>Cost</th>
<th>Participants</th>
<th>Implementations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Develop a standardized mechanism for early warning system and disease alerts</td>
<td>2017-2019</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>Focal points DSRU / DIOs</td>
<td>Financial, Technical, IT support - Data analysis report - Periodic disease warning alerts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conduct simulation exercises for reporting</td>
<td>2017-2020</td>
<td>+++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>National, Provincial focal points + CEP unit</td>
<td>Financial, Technical - CEP established - Training reports and attendance - M&amp;E reports</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Objective 13: Implement effective mass communication

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Feasibility</th>
<th>Cost</th>
<th>Participants</th>
<th>Implementations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Raise public awareness through electronic, print and social media</td>
<td>2017-2020</td>
<td>+++</td>
<td>+++</td>
<td>Communication FPs, social mobilizers</td>
<td>Financial, Technical - 3rd party evaluation reports - Media advertisements</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Feasibility:** Low +, Moderate ++, Highly feasible +++

**Cost:** Low +, Moderate ++, Very costly +++
## OUTPUT 2: PRIORITIZATION RESULTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Objective</th>
<th>Priority rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Objective 1: Develop effective intersectoral coordination mechanisms</td>
<td>3.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objective 5: Establish real time integrated disease surveillance &amp; response mechanisms based on One Health approach</td>
<td>3.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objective 8: Establish and strengthen laboratory network</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objective 9: Develop and implement a cross-sector IDSR (Infectious Disease Surveillance &amp; Reporting) mechanism</td>
<td>3.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objective 3: Capacity building of Animal and Human health professionals</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objective 10: Develop and implement legal framework for disease surveillance, prevention and control</td>
<td>3.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objective 7: Ensure availability and allocation of resources for investigation and response</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objective 6: Development of multi-sectoral contingency plans for zoonotic diseases</td>
<td>3.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objective 11: Develop a functional mechanism for joint communication</td>
<td>3.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objective 4: Need based revision and implementation of curricula at National level</td>
<td>2.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objective 13: Implement effective mass communication</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objective 2: Establishment of National Institute for Infectious and Zoonotic Diseases</td>
<td>2.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objective 12: Capacity building of communication staff</td>
<td>2.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The priority rating is the average rating obtained from the 59 voters, using the following semi-quantitative scale:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Priority Level</th>
<th>Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Very Low</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moderate</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Very High</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Results show that while the development of effective intersectoral coordination mechanisms was selected as the most important objective, the range of priority levels between the various objectives was relatively narrow (2.7 - 3.5), indicating that participants focused on objectives that are all somewhat important.
OUTPUT 3: LINK WITH THE IHR NATIONAL ACTION PLAN FOR PAKISTAN

The last draft of the IHR-NAP is structured objectives in 3 levels:

- Level 1 - PRIORITIES
- Level 2 - OBJECTIVES
- Level 3 - ACTIVITIES, further informed by internal & external resources, timeline, estimated cost, responsibility, required funds etc.

Example

PRIORITY 4: ZOONOTIC DISEASES

OBJECTIVE 1: Developing and implementing necessary legal instruments and coordination mechanisms to adopt a One Health approach for zoonotic disease management

Activity 4.1: Development & endorsement of National Zoonoses Framework at all levels supported by appropriate legislation

Activity 4.2: Establish One Health hub/dashboard with defined ToRs and operational mechanism in collaboration with provinces

The actions discussed by the working groups during the workshop detail some of the activities mentioned in the IHR-NAP when coordination between sectors is involved. The table below indicates the correspondence between the Activities in the IHR-NAP and the actions discussed, both identified by their reference numbers.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activities in the IHR-NAP</th>
<th>1.</th>
<th>2.</th>
<th>3.</th>
<th>4.</th>
<th>5.</th>
<th>6.</th>
<th>7.</th>
<th>8.</th>
<th>9.</th>
<th>10.</th>
<th>11.</th>
<th>12.</th>
<th>13.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.11</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.12</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.13</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.14</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Not in the IHR-NAP
**OUTPUT 4: IMMEDIATE FOLLOW-UPS BY PROVINCE / REGION**

As a follow up of this meeting, what will you do tomorrow when back in your office to improve the coordination for One Health?

| FEDERAL | 1. One Health hub is being established, We (both Health & Livestock sector) will acquaint with One health Platform TORs shared by NIH.  
2. Arrange intra & inter-sectoral meetings to develop coordination mechanisms.  
3. Both sectors (NIH & NARC/NVL) will share already existing LIMS software and work together to develop harmonized LIMS for further actions. |
|---|---|
| PUNJAB | 1. Sensitize colleagues about IHR-PVS, its importance & implementation.  
2. Report immediately any problem relating to public health to all concerned quarters.  
3. Publish the editorials relating to IHR-PVS to educate the masses.  
5. Contact sharing between different departments of One Health. |
| FATA | 1. Notification of Task Force.  
2. Plan for Coordination meetings.  
3. Gap analysis pertaining to One Health.  
4. Meetings for development of mechanisms, TORs, SOPs. |
| BALOCHISTAN | 1. To write a letter DHO/Dy. Director Livestock regarding coordination under One Health.  
2. Data sharing at district and provincial level.  
3. Fortnightly meetings at district and divisional level.  
4. Monthly meetings at provincial level.  
5. Press release at district and divisional level regarding minutes of meetings  
6. Strengthening of already existing isolation ward in FJCH Quetta. |
| SINDH | 1. Will arrange a meeting with colleagues to share the objectives & outcomes of One Health.  
2. Report to higher authorities.  
3. Future scheduling/Planning. |
| KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA | 1. Public Health will lead provincial IHR  
2. Meetings will be called to discuss the issues related to One Health approach and actions will be recommended.  
3. The proposal will be presented to provincial IHR task force for future actions.  
4. Focal persons at provincial & district level will be notified.  
5. A mechanism for periodical review will be developed. |
| GILGIT-BALTISTAN | 1. To request notification of focal point for One health (lead by Health department)  
2. Coordination of all stakeholders from public health, animal health, environment, food and agriculture and schedule meetings for all stakeholders.  
3. Develop a provincial action plan in line with the national action plan.  
4. Notification of district focal points led by health.  
5. Dissemination of provincial action plan to district level and to all stakeholders. |
| AZAD JAMMU & KASHMIR | 1. We will have a meeting with concerned people of health department to define a program on how to work together in the future, especially for the upcoming event of EID QURBAN to minimize the chances of CCHF outbreak in our region.  
2. Follow up of IHR Task Force. |
## OUTPUT 5: TORS OF THE ONE HEALTH HUB

I. Provide a platform of coordination to share and discuss information, experiences and findings of zoonotic diseases and to devise future strategies.

II. Serve as an informational resource for emerging & re-emerging zoonotic diseases, environmental factors such as climate and disasters, and latest news, including professional opinions on particular topics.

III. Coordinate through Technical Experts Advisory Group (TEAG) for planning implementation and strategize to handle zoonotic diseases of national and international concern.

IV. Strengthen a network for communication between stakeholders and professionals and streamline the information regarding any zoonotic event.

V. Play a coordinating role during outbreak investigations and develop liaison between human, animal and environment health sectors & partners to detect and respond to events of zoonotic origin.

VI. Issue alerts, advisories and suggestions on zoonotic disease events.

VII. Provide technical support to provincial human & animal health management teams to develop and implement provincial preparedness and response plans for zoonotic interventions.

VIII. Conduct advocacy and awareness campaigns, joint studies and implementation of One Health concept.

IX. Provide Support to the training of provincial and district One Health teams.
OUTPUT 6: COORDINATION MECHANISMS

Surveillance and information sharing

Step 1: Identify contacts for surveillance and information sharing in both sectors
Step 2: Identify events and incidents where information sharing is required
Step 3: Determine the roles and responsibilities of each sector
Step 4: Evaluate and revise the protocol where necessary

Coordinated response

Step 1: Identify the events, scenarios and locations where coordinated responses are required
Step 2: Identify activities to be coordinated in these events, scenarios and locations
Step 3: Clarify each sector’s roles and responsibilities in these events, scenarios and locations
Step 4: Evaluate progress and revise the protocol where necessary

Risk reduction

Step 1: Identify high-risk areas, populations at risk, practices and behaviors
Step 2: Identify measures to reduce risks
Step 3: Determine roles and responsibilities for risk reduction measures
Step 4: Evaluate and revise the plan for risk reduction interventions/activities where necessary
OUTPUT 7: KEY WORKSHOP RECOMMENDATIONS & WAY FORWARD

Key Workshop Recommendations

1. The workshop recognized the need for institutionalization of joint coordination mechanisms for One Health with defined roles and responsibilities and operating procedures between human health and veterinary sectors at all levels;

2. There is need for strengthening technical collaboration between both human health and veterinary sectors for:
   i. Integrated disease surveillance
   ii. Response including laboratory network
   iii. Communication (regular and risk communication)
   iv. Human Resource development including capacity building/ training

3. We expect that the recommendations will contribute to the implementation of IHR through supporting the IHR MEF, IHR NAP and the PVS Pathway (Gap Analysis).

Way Forward

1. Establishment of One Health Hub with inclusion of human health, veterinary, agriculture and environment sectors with finalization and endorsement of ToRs;

2. Nomination of focal points for One Health at the Federal and Provincial/ Regional levels from health and veterinary sectors;

3. Share workshop recommendations with the health and veterinary departments at the provincial and regional levels to allocate necessary resources for implementation;

4. Capacity building of the nominated focal persons to take forward the approach of One Health in their provinces/ regions;

5. Ensure implementation of the recommendations/ next steps defined by the provincial and regional working groups; and,

6. Introduction of joint periodic reviews at all levels.
Many participants pointed out that this workshop marked the first time that MNHSRC and MLDD had liaised in such a collaborative exploration of a better One Health strategy, and the participants agreed that they now felt well-placed to explore joint strategies to address, within the next year, many of the major gaps identified.

An evaluation questionnaire was completed by 74 participants in order to collect feedback on the relevance of such workshops. The vast majority of the national participants to the workshops rated the workshop highly, being for the most part “fully satisfied”, or otherwise “satisfied” with both the content and the format of the workshop (Table 3). In addition, when asked about the level of impact of the workshop, 91% and 85% of participants answered ‘high impact’ or ‘very high impact’ on their technical knowledge and on the work of their department/unit respectively.

Table 3: Results of the overall assessment of the event by participants (74 respondents)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Overall assessment of the event</th>
<th>Participants 'satisfied' or 'fully satisfied'</th>
<th>Average rating (/4)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Content</td>
<td>96%</td>
<td>3.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Structure / Format</td>
<td>92%</td>
<td>3.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organization</td>
<td>95%</td>
<td>3.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

“This was the first time that so many representatives from both sectors sat together and worked on how to improve their collaboration. It was very motivational”

“This innovative approach creates a very conducive environment for these important discussions”

“The workshop was very well structured and very interactive. It was great to gather so many stakeholders and a lot was achieved”
## ANNEX 1: WORKSHOP AGENDA

### Day 1: 09 May 2017

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Participants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0830-0900</td>
<td>Registration of participants</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0900-1030</td>
<td><strong>Opening Session</strong></td>
<td>Dr Assad Hafeez</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Recitation of Holy Quran</td>
<td>Dr Khurshid Ahmad</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Opening Remarks</td>
<td>Dr Yusuf Zafar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• DG Health MNHSRC</td>
<td>Dr Stephane de La Rocque</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Chief Veterinary Officer/ Animal Husbandry Commissioner MNFSR</td>
<td>Dr Muhammad Assai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Chairman Pakistan Agricultural Research Council</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Remarks from HQ WHO</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• WHO Representative Pakistan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1030-1230</td>
<td><strong>Session 1: Workshop Objectives and National Perspectives</strong></td>
<td>Dr Malik M Safi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Introduction of participants</td>
<td>Dr M Azeem Khan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The OIE - WHO collaboration and vision</td>
<td>Dr Guillaume Belot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1030-1100</td>
<td><strong>Tea Break</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1030-1230</td>
<td>Coordination Mechanisms &amp; One Health challenges under IHR &amp; PVS Pathway</td>
<td>Dr Malik M Safi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Human Health Perspective</td>
<td>Dr M Azeem Khan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Veterinary Health Perspective</td>
<td>Dr Guillaume Belot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Workshop approach and methodology</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1230-1400</td>
<td><strong>Lunch Break</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1400-1500</td>
<td><strong>Session 2: The Road to One Health</strong></td>
<td>Dr Malik Safi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Movie: interaction do happen when needed</td>
<td>Dr Khalid Naeem</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Plenary discussion (experience sharing)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1400-1500</td>
<td><strong>Session 3: Navigating the Road to One Health (Working Groups)</strong></td>
<td>WHO HQ Facilitators</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1500-1730</td>
<td>• Presentation of the working group exercise</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Working groups: Case study (working groups by disease)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Day 2: 10 May 2017

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Participants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0900-0915</td>
<td>Feedback from day 1</td>
<td>Dr Jamil Ansari</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Dr Stéphane De La Rocque</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0915-1015</td>
<td>• Restitution of working groups</td>
<td>Working groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Plenary discussion</td>
<td>Dr Najam Baig</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1015-1045</td>
<td><strong>Coffee break</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1045-1300</td>
<td><strong>Session 4: Bridges along the road to One Health</strong></td>
<td>Movie</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Presentation of the tools (1/2) (IHR MEF including JEE, PVS Pathway)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time</td>
<td>Activity</td>
<td>Presenter(s)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1300-1400</td>
<td>Lunch</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Session 5: Crossroads - IHR MEF, JEE and PVS Pathway reports</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1400-1630</td>
<td>• Presentation of the tools (2/2) (Handbook)</td>
<td>Movie Dr Guillaume Belot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Presentation of the working group exercise</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Working groups: Extract main results from the PVS and IHR reports (including JEE), in relation to gaps identified on the matrix and discuss operational options (groups organized by technical topic)</td>
<td>All Facilitators</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Session 6: Roadmap – Joint objectives and activities</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0900-0915</td>
<td>Feedback from day 2</td>
<td>Dr Jamil Ansari Dr Stéphane De La Rocque</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0915-1200</td>
<td>• Presentation of the working group exercise</td>
<td>Dr Guillaume Belot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Working groups: Identification of joint objectives and practical activities to implement</td>
<td>All Facilitators</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• World café</td>
<td>All Facilitators</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Finalization of the objectives/activities for each technical area</td>
<td>All Facilitators</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1200-1300</td>
<td>Lunch</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1300-1500</td>
<td>Session 7: Roadmap - Reaching consensus</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1500-1530</td>
<td>Coffee break</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1530-1550</td>
<td>Closing Session</td>
<td>Dr Najam Baig/ Dr Mumtaz Khan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1550-1610</td>
<td>Sharing of Draft TORs for One Health Hub</td>
<td>Dr Malik Safi Director Programs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1610-1630</td>
<td>Final plenary discussion: Key workshop recommendations</td>
<td>Dr Johar Ali Member ASD PARC Dr Mukhtar Ahmed ED NIH Dr Khurshid Ahmad Rep AHC/CVO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Closing Remarks</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Vote of Thanks</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Day 3: 11 May 2017**
ANNEX 2: LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

MINISTRY OF NATIONAL HEALTH SERVICES
REGULATIONS AND COORDINATION

Dr Assad Hafeez
Director General – MNHSRC
az10@hotmail.com

Dr Malik Muhammad Safi
Director, Programs / HPSIU: IHR-GHSA
dr_msafi@hotmail.com

Dr Qurban Ali
Animal Husbandry Commissioner
M/o National Food Security & Research
drqurban@yahoo.com

Dr Khalid Naeem Khawaja
Consultant Microbiologist/ One Health Expert
naeem1955@gmail.com

Dr Muhammad Salman
National IHR Focal Person - NIH
salman14m@gmail.com

PROVINCIAL DEPARTMENTS

PUNJAB

Dr Bashir Ahmed
Director CDC/Public Health
rahmabashir@gmail.com

Dr Aun Raza
Senior Instructor - SKMC Hospital
aunraza@skm.org.pk

Dr Anjum Razzaque
Institute of Public Health
anjrazzq@gmail.com

Dr Masood Rabbani
Director Department of Microbiology
Faculty of Veterinary Sciences
University of Veterinary & Animal Sciences
mrabbani@uvas.edu.pk

Dr Abdur Rehman Afzal
Microbiologist
abrehman2044@gmail.com

Dr Tahir Yaqoob
WTO Quality Lab
University of Veterinary & Animal Sciences
tahiryaqub@uvas.edu.pk

Dr Aamir Ghafoor Bajwa
Director University of Veterinary & Animal Sciences
aamirghafoor@uvas.edu.pk

Dr Muhammad Iqbal
Director Veterinary Research Institute
fmdiqbal@outlook.com

Dr Mashkoor Mohsin
Assistant Professor - University of Agriculture
mashkoormohsin@uaf.edu.pk

Dr Shafia Tehsin Gul
Assistant Professor - University of Agriculture
drshafia66@yahoo.com

Dr Masood Akhtar
Dean - Faculty of Veterinary Sciences
Bahauddin Zakria University
veterinary@bzu.edu.pk

SINDH

Dr Muhammad Saleem Memon
Additional Director (PH)
Director General Health Services
memon.doctor@hotmail.com

Dr Mubeen Ahmed
Provincial Coordinator (DHIS)
Directorate General Health Services
mobin.memon@yahoo.com

Dr Amir Bux
Microbiologist - Peoples University of Medical Sciences Hospital Shaheed Benazirabad
dramirbuxdetho65@gmail.com
Dr Ali Akber Soomro
DG Livestock, Hyderabad
dglivestocksindh@gmail.com

Dr Parkash Deewani
Senior Research Officer - Veterinary Research & Diagnosis Sindh - Central Veterinary Diagnostic Lab
dewani_cvdl@yahoo.com

Dr Moomal Bughio
Research Officer - Poultry Research Institute
moomal-bughio@yahoo.com

Dr Manzoor Asif Pathan
Disease Investigation Lab
Animal Livestock Production Complex
mangoorasifpathan@yahoo.com

Dr Nazeer Hussain Kalhoro
Director - Sindh Poultry & Vaccine Centre
Animal/Livestock Production Complex
drnazeerhussain@hotmail.com

Dr Rumina Hasan
Consultant Microbiologist - AKU
rumina.hasan@aku.edu

KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA

Dr Shaheen Afridi
Director Public Health
IHR Focal Person
shaheenafridi@gmail.com

Dr Mirza Ali Khan
Director General - L&DD FATA
drmirza62@yahoo.com

Dr Syed Asad Aali Shah
Deputy Epidemiologist IHR Focal Person
D.I. Lab, L&DD Peshawar, KPK
aa.shah@yahoo.com

Dr Kalsoom Bibi
Veterinary Officer - L&DD Peshawar, KPK
kalsoom.2847@gmail.com

BALOCHISTAN

Dr. Masood Qadir Nousherwani
DGHS, Quetta
dghs_balochistan@yahoo.com

Dr Muneer Kasi
Program Coordinator - Quetta

Dr. Ghulam Sarwar Pirkani
Consultant Microbiologist, BMCH Quetta
pirkani77@gmail.com

Dr Saima Iram
Pathologist / Focal Person Lab
drsaima@yahoo.com

Dr Tariq Kiani
Director - CASVAB, Animal Sciences Complex
tariqkianiraja@hotmail.com

Dr Bahawal Haq
Divisional Officer - L&DD
buhaqzhob@gmail.com

Dr Aitabar Khan
Deputy Director/ IHR Focal Person - L&DD
aitabark03@gmail.com

FATA

Dr Anisa Afridi
IHR Focal Person
anisaafirdi@yahoo.com

Dr Malik Ayaz Wazir
Director - L&DD FATA
ayaz1961@hotmail.com
Dr Zia ud Din  
Deputy Director / IHR Focal Person  
L & DD FATA  
zeia677@yahoo.com  

AZAD JAMMU & KASHMIR  

Dr Matloob Hussain Raja  
Animal Husbandry Department AJK  

Dr Shafqat Mehmood  
IHR Focal Person  
Animal Husbandry Department AJK  
shafqatm521@gmail.com  

Dr Adnan Rasheed Malik  
Deputy Director Planning  
adnan_riasi@hotmail.com  

Dr Nabila Latif  
VO (H) - L&DD AJK  
nabilalatif46@gmail.com  

Dr Mumtaz Ahmed  
AIMS  
mumtazahmad8166@gmail.com  

Syed Naeem ur Rehman  
FELTP  
drnadeemsyed999@gmail.com  

GILGIT  

Dr Rasheed Ahmed  
DOH - Gilgit  
rashadahmad.dr@gmail.com  

Dr. Hafizullah  
Focal Person IHR  
hafeezdhsgb@gmail.com  

Dr. Ejaz ud Din  
Pathologist / Focal Person Labs  
ejazmalkal@gmail.com  

Dr Zaeem Zia  
DOH - Gilgit  
zaeemzia983@gmail.com  

ISLAMABAD & RAWALPINDI  

Dr Brig Aamer Ikram  
CMH Peshawar  
mahin1@yahoo.com  

Dr Rana Jawad Asghar  
Resident Advisor, FELTP Pakistan  
bvv9@cdc.gov  

Dr Nadeem Younas  
Shifa International Hospital  
neem.y2010@gmail.com  

Dr Ejaz Khan  
Consultant Pediatrician Shifa International Hospital  
ejazkhan99@hotmail.com  

Dr Shazia Nazeer  
Directorate of L&DD Rawalpindi  

Dr Madeeha Shams  
Intern at FELTP  
madeeha.shams@gmail.com  

Ms Sidra Manzoor  
Intern at NIH  
gondalsidra@yahoo.com  

Dr Nadia Noreen  
Directorate General of Health Establishment  
nadia.jamil3@gmail.com  

Dr Mamoona Tahir  
PH England  
momoona.tahir@phe.gov.uk  

Dr Rafay  
PH England  
rafay.aku.epibio@gmmail.com
Dr Tamkeen Ghafoor  
FELTP Pakistan  
gafoor.tamkeen@gmail.com

Dr Farooq Azam  
TRF & Representing DFID  
farooq.azam@trfpakistan.org

Dr Muhammad Tayyab  
IHR Coordinator, MNHSRC  
drtayyab3@gmail.com

Dr Uzam Bashir  
Senior Virologist, NIH  
uzmaaamir73@yahoo.com

Dr Faheem Tahir  
Chief, PHLD, NIH  
faheemtahir2000@gmail.com

Dr Jamil Ansari  
Chief, FEDSD, NIH  
jam62aa@gmail.com

Dr Muntaz Ali  
Medical Officer FEDSD / NIH  
drmomi74@gmail.com

Dr Najamullah Baig  
SSO, NIH, Islamabad  
najamullah@yahoo.com

Dr Moin Iqbal  
Epidemiologist, NIH  
drmoiniqbal@gmail.com

Dr Urooj Aqeel  
FEDSD / NIH  
uroojdouhile@hotmail.com

Dr Farooq Tahir  
PRI, Rawalpindi  
drmftahir@gmail.com

Dr Khurshid Ahmed  
PSO, NVL  
khurshid5@hotmail.com

Dr Zahida Fatima  
Deputy Director (AH), ASD, PARC  
zahidavet@yahoo.com

Dr Aman Ullah  
SSO, AHP, ASI, NARC  
amanvet@gmail.com

Dr Hamid Irshad  
SSO, AHP, ASI, NARC  
hamidirshad@hotmail.com

Dr M. Javed Arshad  
SSO, NVL  
mjnvil786@gmail.com

Dr Akbar Ali  
Scientific Officer - NRPD, ASI, NARC  
drakbaralimalik@gmail.com

Dr Adnan Saeed  
Scientific Officer, NVL  
adnan.saeed92@gmail.com

Dr Naila Siddique  
SSO/PL, NRPD, ASI, NARC  
naila.nrlpd@gmail.com

Dr M. Athar Abbas  
SSO, NRPD, ASI, NARC  
matharabbas@hotmail.com

WHO & OIE

Dr Mohammad Assai  
WHO Representative Pakistan a.i  
assaim@who.int

Dr. Stéphane de La Rocque  
Technical Advisor - WHO HQ  
delarocques@who.int

Dr. Guillaume Belot  
Technical Officer - WHO HQ  
belotg@who.int
Dr. John Woodford
Representative OIE
jdwoodford@gmail.com

Dr Michael Lukwiya
Cluster Lead
lukwiyam@who.int

Dr Farah Sabih
National Professional Officer GHI
sabihf@who.int

Ms Zouyya Ashar
Team Assistant:
asharz@who.int